# <sub>(046)</sub>9201014



No. <u>42 / DDD / TTS</u> Dated 28<sup>th</sup> March, 2024

SUBJECT: MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF GRIEVANCE REDRESSAL COMMITTEE

UNDER "PUJAB CITIES PROGRAMME" IN TEHSIL GOJRA HELD ON

21-03-2024 IN THE OFFICE OF DEPUTY DIRECTOR (DEVELOPMENT)

TOBA TEK SINGH

In pursuance of constitution of Grievance Redressal Committee under "Punjab Cities Programme" by Administrator MC Gojra / Assistant Commissioner Gojra vide No. 260-263 dated 17-07-2023, a meeting of grievance committee was held on 21-03-2024 in the office of Deputy Director (Dev.) T.T.Singh to readdress the grievances / issues arising between contractors / bidders and procuring agency i.e. Municipal Committee Gojra during of implementation of "Punjab Cities Programme" in Gojra. The meeting was attended by the following participants:

- i. Deputy Director (Dev.) Toba Tek Singh (Convener)
- ii. Municipal Officer (Regulation) MC Gojra (Member)
- iii. Municipal Officer (Planning) MC Gojra (Member)
- iv. Municipal Officer (Infrastructure) MC Gojra
- v. M. Zubair Zafar R.E Package-03 PCP (Representative of MMP Consultants)
- vi. Mudassar Ashraf (Representative of PMDFC)
- vii. Nabeel Ahmed Sub Engineer MC Gojra
- viii. Rana Akhtar M/s H.M.S Enterprises
- ix. Usama Shafique M/s Sanni Enterprises
- 2. Meeting was started with the recitation of Holy Quran. Opening the discussion, the convener welcomed the participants and directed to proceed with as per agenda. Municipal Officer (Regulation) MC Gojra briefed that the purpose of the meeting is to discuss / decide the grievance filed by one of the bidder M/s H.M.S Enterprises regarding scheme titled "Upgradation of Sewerage System and Construction of Wastewater Treatment Plant (WWTP) Gojra City (Package-4 Construction of Waste Water Treatment Plant (WWTP))" while extending

\*

Page 1 of 3

 $_{\rm an}$  opportunity of hearing to the representatives of Consultants (MMP), M/s H.M.S Enterprises,  $_{\rm M/s}$  Sanni Enterprises and tender opening committee.

- The aggrieved bidder M/s H.M.S Enterprises explained the forum that rate quoted by M/s Sunni Enterprises is 16.68% below for the said scheme but on ground M/s Sanni Enterprises offered a discount of Rs.290.00 million below the quoted rate, which is not included in the evaluation report. He furthered that M/s Sanni Enterprises should have to work as per given rates including discount offered, otherwise, bid of M/s Sanni Enterprises may be rejected and being the second lowest bidder, we, the M/s H.M.S Enterprises, are ready to work as per our quoted rates.
  - 4. M/s Sanni Enterprises explained to the forum that clarification was provided regarding quoted bid numbers in the presence of entire committee including the participant contractors in a transparent manner as witnessed by the committee members and participant contractors. He further explained that letter of acceptance was issued to us upon conclusion of grievance period under PPRA Rules and we promptly fulfilled all requisite requirements for contract execution. He furthered that evaluation of bids was carried out by designated consultant firm in order to ensure impartiality and expertise in the assessment process. He requested that grievance filed by M/s H.M.S Enterprises may be disregarded keeping in view the fairness / transparency of the bidding process as narrated above.
    - 5. Municipal Officer Infrastructure MC Gojra briefed that financial bids of the said scheme were opened on 01-02-2024 and the rates quoted by all the bidders were clarified in the presence of Procurement Committee and its co-opted members. Moreover, financial evaluation report formulated by the consultants was based on the clarification obtained during the opening of financial bids and letter of acceptance has already been issued to the lowest bidder after approval of competent authority upon completion of grievance period. The same stance has also been reiterated by Chief Officer MC Gojra / Convener Tender Opening Committee vide letter No. 313-14 dated 22-03-2024.

### **DECISION:**

6. After detailed discussion / deliberations, perusing the relevant record, assessing the statements / viewpoints of all the stakeholders and consulting relevant rules, the grievance redressal committee unanimously decided that grievance filed by M/s H.M.S Enterprises may be

Page 2 of 3



 $_{rejected}$  on the basis of Rule 67(2) of PPRA Rules 2014 since the grievance was filed after  $_{conclusion}$  of grievance period i.e. 10 days after the announcement of bid evaluation report.

7. The meeting ended with the vote of thanks.

Note: Attendance sheet is also attached.

(TOSIF-UR-REHMAN)
MUNICIPAL OFFICER (REGULATION)
MUNICIPAL COMMITTEE GOJRA

(MUHAMMAD ASAD)
MUNICIPAL OFFICER (PLANNING)
MUNICIPAL COMMITTEE GOJRA

(AHMAD JAWAD SARDAR)
DEPUTY DIRECTOR (DEV.)
TOBA TEK SINGH



## بلديم مستحكم-ينجاب مستحكم

OFFICE OF THE MUNICIPAL COMMITTEE GOJRA LG NO. 35301

Email: mcgojratts@gmail.com

Ph. No. 0469200082 No. 1127-29 Date. 26/01/24.

To,

The Deputy Director Development Toba Tek Singh.

### SUBJECT: GRIEVANCE REDRESSAL

Kindly refer to committee comprised vide No. 260-263 dated 17-07-2023 by Administrator Municipal Committee Gojra (copy attached).

It is submitted that a scheme named 'Upgradation of sewerage system and construction of wastewater treatment plant (WWTP) Gojra city' Package-2 Disposal station and forcemain, was advertised under Punjab Cities Program (PCP). The financial bids were opened on 27-12-2024.

The financial evaluation report has been submitted by consultants (MMP (pvt) Ltd) on 08-01-2024 and same was approved by the tender opening committee.

Now, M/s M. Hanif Anjum (2<sup>nd</sup> lowest bidder) has submitted its grievance regarding financial evaluation (copy attached). You are requested to please look into the matter and convene a meeting of the grievance redressal committee for timely resolution in best public interest.

An early response will be appreciated.

CHIEF OFFICER
MUNICIPAL COMMITTEE
GOJRA

A copy is forwarded for information to:

- 1. The Administrator MC Gojra
- 2. The MO (I) MC Gojra
- 3. M/s M. Hanif Anjum

To,

- The Chief Officer Municipal Committee Gojra
- The SPO Procurement PMDFC, Lahore
- The Team Leader / CRE Package III-PCP, MMP (Pvt) Ltd, Lahore
- 4. M/s M. Hanif Anjum RCC Pipe factory, Rajana Road Toba Tek Singh
- M/s Shad Construction Co. Street No. 2/A Haideria road, Gulghast Colony Multan

#### MEETING NOTICE FOR GRIEVANCE REDRESSAL SUBJECT:

It is to inform you that a meeting regarding the grievance submitted by M/s M. Hanif Anjum is going to be held in the office of undersigned on 01-02-2024 at 02:00 pm.

You are required to direct your team / representative to attend the meeting with relevant record on above mentioned time and date.

> Dy. Director Development **Toba Tek Singh**

No: 18-26 Date: 29/01/2024

A copy is forwarded for information to:

- The Administrator Municipal Committee Gojra 1.
- The Deputy Program Director PCP, PMDFC, Lahore 2.
- All members of GR Committee 3.